

Page Denied

TOP SECRET

THE DIRECTOR OF CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE

WASHINGTON, D. C. 20505

National Intelligence Officers

TS 771508
SP - 48/77
23 February 1977
Copy 1

MEMORANDUM FOR: Acting Director of Central Intelligence

SUBJECT: A Team Comments on B Team Reports

1. Dick Lehman and I have been seeking a way to complete the actions George Bush agreed with Leo Cherne to undertake in connection with A Team-B Team experiment of last year, without unnecessarily interrupting the ongoing work of the intelligence analysis community on these and other important issues and without inviting further politicization or leaks about the experiment.

2. An aspect of the agreed ground rules which was not carried out in full was the requirement for written commentary by the several teams on each others' reports. This was handled orally, except of course that much of the Pipes Team report was in fact a critique of both the A Team's views of Soviet objectives and of intelligence estimates on Soviet strategic forces in general. To respond to the formal requirement, but primarily to review and analyze the Pipes Team critique, Dick Lehman and I called [redacted] 25X1 out of retirement to prepare a review, which he did with the help of comments previously prepared by the A Team leaders, a separate review of the Pipes Team criticisms done largely by the CIA/DDI offices, and his own detailed review of the record of past estimates. We have coordinated this review with representatives of the DDI and the IC Staff.

3. With this thorough review in hand, we face the question of whether to retain the material for our internal files only, to coordinate it with the community's estimative machinery, or to forward it under your cover memo without further coordination. We believe that if we merely filed it we would deny it to legitimate users like the IC Staff, the Senate Select Committee Staff, and of course the President's National Security Advisor and PFIAB, whom Dr. Cherne originally anticipated would organize a post-audit of the experiment. On the other hand, we are aware that an attempt to coordinate in the community would reopen contention about Soviet objectives

25X1

25X1

TOP SECRET

~~TOP SECRET~~

-2-

TS 771508
SP - 48/77

SUBJECT: A Team Comments on B Team Reports.

at a time when the NFIB is taking constructive actions to bring more evidence and analysis to bear on the subject.

4. We therefore recommend that you forward these comments to complete the action and to enable us and the recipients to make controlled further use of them as appropriate. Please note in this connection that George Bush's comments to Chairman, PFIAB, on the Pipes Team recommendations about intelligence methodology were forwarded after coordination with DDI and IC Staff only.

5. The comments and a transmittal memorandum for your signature are attached.



25X1

Howard Stoertz, Jr.
National Intelligence Officer
for Strategic Programs

Attachment

25X1

~~TOP SECRET~~

TOP SECRET

-3-

TS 771508
SP - 48/77

SUBJECT: A Team Comments on B Team Reports

Distribution:

- Cy 1 - ADGI NIO/SP
- 2 - ER
- 3 - D/DCI/IC
- 4 - D/DCI/NI
- 5 - DDI
- 6 - NIO/USSR
- 7 - ~~NIO/SP~~ *destroyed 1 MAR 1984* *mao*
- 8 - D/OPEI/ICS
- 9 - D/OSR
- 10 - OSR/SEC [redacted]
- 11 - Ch, SALT Support Staff
- 12 - NIO/RI

25X1

NIO/SP:HStoertz [redacted] (23Feb77)

25X1

25X1

TOP SECRET